

# HSR

---

---

Health Services Research  
Volume 39, Number 4, Part II  
August 2004

---

## VISION STATEMENT

To be the preferred forum for health services researchers, managers, policymakers, providers, and students (1) to exchange ideas; (2) to expand the knowledge and understanding of the financing, organization, delivery, and outcomes of health services; and thereby, (3) to help improve the health of individuals and communities.

## MISSION STATEMENT

To enhance knowledge and understanding of the financing, organization, delivery, and outcomes of health services through publication of thoughtful, timely, rigorously conducted, state-of-the-art research and thinking.

## KEY VALUES

- Scientific Integrity
- Methodological Rigor
- Policy and Practice Relevance
- Timeliness
- Creativity
- Clarity of Thought
- Clarity of Expression

---

*A publication of the Health Research and Educational Trust*

---

*Published bimonthly for the Health Research and Educational  
Trust by Blackwell Publishing, Inc.*

*The official journal of AcademyHealth*

Made possible in part by support from:

University of California, San Francisco  
Institute for Health Policy Studies  
with  
Dartmouth Medical School, Hanover, NH  
Center for the Evaluative Clinical Sciences

2004 Sponsors

---

Appreciation is expressed to these organizations for the provision of educational support grants to the Journal. Their generous support enables *Health Services Research* to expand the number of pages per issue and to introduce new features of interest to the field.

These grants support the independent role of *Health Services Research* in providing a forum for the field and for the Journal's readers. In no way do they influence the content and decisions of the editors and editorial board of the Journal.

### Advertising

For information and rates, please visit the Journal's website at [www.blackwellpublishing.com/hsr](http://www.blackwellpublishing.com/hsr), e-mail: [aidcads@aidcvt.com](mailto:aidcads@aidcvt.com), or contact Faith Elliott, Blackwell Advertising Representative, 50 Winter Sport Lane, P.O. Box 80, Williston, VT 05495; phone: 800-866-1684 or fax: 802-864-7749. To advertise career opportunities in health services research, please contact [jshaw@aha.org](mailto:jshaw@aha.org) or [www.hsr.org](http://www.hsr.org).

*Health Services Research* is available through **Synergy**, a journal service that allows you to:

- Browse tables of contents and abstracts from more than 290 professional, science, and medical journals
- Create your own Personal Homepage from which you can access your personal subscriptions, set up e-mail table of contents alerts, and run saved searches
- Perform detailed searches across our database of titles and save the search criteria for future use
- Link to and from bibliographic databases such as ISI and PubMed (MEDLINE).

Sign up for free today at <http://www.blackwell-synergy.com/>



**Blackwell**  
E-mail Alerts

Keep up with new publications from Blackwell Publishing. Join our free e-mail alerting service, and we'll send you journal tables of contents (with links to abstracts) and news of our latest books in your field. Signing up is easy. Simply visit [www.blackwellpublishing.com/ealerts](http://www.blackwellpublishing.com/ealerts). Choose which discipline interests you and we'll send you a message every other week, *or* select exactly which books and journals you'd like to hear about and when you'd like to receive your messages.

## Health Services Research

---

- Publisher:** Mary Pittman, Dr.P.H., Health Research and Educational Trust  
**Coeditor-in-chief:** Ann Barry Flood, Ph.D., Center for the Evaluative Clinical Sciences at Dartmouth, Dartmouth Medical School  
**Coeditor-in-chief:** Harold S. Luft, Ph.D., Institute for Health Policy Studies, University of California, San Francisco  
**Editor Emeritus:** Gordon H. DeFries, Ph.D., University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill  
**Editor Emeritus:** Stephen M. Shortell, Ph.D., University of California, Berkeley  
**Senior Associate Editor:** Carolyn M. Clancy, M.D., Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality  
**Senior Associate Editor:** José J. Escarce, M.D., Ph.D., David Geffen School of Medicine at University of California, Los Angeles  
**Senior Associate Editor:** Phillip R. Kletke, Ph.D., Health Research and Educational Trust  
**Senior Associate Editor:** Nicole Lurie, M.D., M.S.P.H., The RAND Corporation, Washington, DC.  
**Senior Associate Editor:** Catherine McLaughlin, Ph.D., University of Michigan  
**Senior Associate Editor:** Albert L. Siu, M.D., M.S.P.H., Mount Sinai Medical Center, New York and Bronx VA Medical Center, New York  
**Managing Editor:** Meighan Schreiber, M.S.S.A., University of California, San Francisco
- 

*Health Services Research* (ISSN 0017-9124; ISSN Online 1475-6773) is published six times a year by Blackwell Publishing, Inc. for the Health Research and Educational Trust. Blackwell Publishing, Inc. offices are located at 350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148, U.S.A. and 9600 Garsington Road, Oxford OX4 2DQ, U.K. Call: 1-800-835-6770 or fax: (781) 388-8232; e-mail: [subscrip@bos.blackwellpublishing.com](mailto:subscrip@bos.blackwellpublishing.com).

**Subscription Rates for Volume 39, 2004:** Institutional Premium Rate (includes online access to the current and all available backfiles), The Americas \$494.00, U.K./Rest of World £369.00; Personal Rate, The Americas \$95.00, U.K./Rest of World £73.00 (€110). Single Issues Institutions: The Americas \$67.00, U.K./Rest of World £50.00; Personal: The Americas \$14.00, U.K./Rest of World £11.00. Print and online-only rates are also available on the publisher's website. Customers in Canada should add 7% GST to The Americas rate or provide evidence of entitlement to exemption. Customers in the U.K. and E.U. should add VAT at 5% to the Rest of World rate or provide a VAT registration number or evidence of entitlement to exemption. For more information about online access to Blackwell Publishing journals, including access information and terms and conditions, please visit [www.blackwellpublishing.com](http://www.blackwellpublishing.com). Other pricing options for institutions are also available on our website, or on request from our customer service department (see contact information above).

**The Internet website address for *Health Services Research* is**  
**<http://www.hsr.org>**

**Information for Subscribers:** For new orders, renewals, sample copy requests, claims, changes of address, and all other subscription correspondences for **non-AcademyHealth members**, please contact the Customer Service Department at the publisher's Malden office (address listed above). **For AcademyHealth members**, please contact Membership Services, AcademyHealth, 1801 K St. NW, Ste. 701-L, Washington, DC 20006-1301; tel: 202-292-6700; fax 202-292-6800; e-mail: [membership@academyhealth.org](mailto:membership@academyhealth.org). Send old as well as new address, including zip code, in notice of change; allow six weeks for change. Make checks payable to Blackwell Publishing, Inc. Claims for undelivered copies must be made no later than six months following month of publication. The publisher will supply missing copies when losses have been sustained in transit and when the reserve stock will permit.

**Microform:** The journal is available on microfilm. For microfilm service, address inquiries directly to ProQuest, 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106, U.S.A.

Manuscripts and correspondence on editorial matters should be addressed to the editor. Editorial office is at University of California, San Francisco, 3333 California Street, Suite 265, San Francisco, CA 94118.

© The paper in this publication meets the requirements of the ANSI Standard Z39.48-1984 (Permanence of Paper) effective with Volume 18, issue number 1.

**Mailing:** Periodicals postage paid at Boston, MA and additional mailing offices. Mailing to rest of world by Deutsche Post Global Mail. Canadian mail is sent by Canadian publications mail agreement number 40573520. Postmaster: Send all address changes to Health Services Research, Blackwell Publishing, Inc., Journals Subscription Department, 350 Main St., Malden, MA 02148-5018.

**Electronic Access:** Abstract information for this journal is available electronically at <http://www.blackwellpublishing.com/hsr/>. For information on full-text access, see <http://www.blackwellpublishing.com>. For more information and for electronic access to past volumes, visit [www.hsr.org](http://www.hsr.org).

**Back Issues:** Back issues are available from the publisher at the current single-issue rate.

**Copyright:** © 2004 Health Research and Education Trust. All rights reserved. With the exception of fair dealing for the purposes of research or private study, or criticism or review, no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored, or transmitted in any form or by any means without the prior permission in writing from the copyright holder. Authorization to photocopy items for internal and personal use is granted by the copyright holder for libraries and other users of the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, U.S.A. ([www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com)), provided the appropriate fee is paid directly to the CCC. This consent does not extend to other kinds of copying, such as copying for general distribution for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. Institutions with a paid subscription to this journal may make photocopies for teaching purposes free of charge provided such copies are not resold. For all other permissions inquiries, including requests to republish material in another work, please contact the Journals Rights & Permissions Coordinator, Blackwell Publishing, 9600 Garsington Road, Oxford OX4 2DQ, U.K. E-mail: [JournalsRights@oxon.blackwellpublishing.com](mailto:JournalsRights@oxon.blackwellpublishing.com).

---

---

# Announcement

---

## *HSR Moves to Electronic Only Submissions*

*Health Services Research* is pleased to announce the second phase in its move to electronic management of the review process. In collaboration with Blackwell Publishing, we have implemented a new interface using Manuscript Central, a web-based system. Potential reviewers will identify their areas of disciplinary expertise and substantive interest and authors will similarly categorize their manuscripts. This will allow a far better matching of reviewers and manuscripts. The web-based approach includes the automatic conversion of manuscripts to PDF format to maintain confidentiality and security, as well as reducing cluttered “in boxes.” By going to the secure website, authors will also be able to know the current status of their manuscript as it moves through each step in our process.

The website can be accessed at <http://hsr.manuscriptcentral.com>. If you have not logged on already as a potential reviewer, please do so. If you have previously submitted or reviewed a manuscript for *Health Services Research* and we have your correct e-mail address, your contact information has been preloaded on the site. To verify if you already have an account, please go to <http://hsr.manuscriptcentral.com> and utilize the “check for existing account” option on the login page. If you discover that you do not have an account, you can create one using the “create an account” option also on the login page. If you need assistance, please contact Meighan Schreiber at [hsr@itsa.ucsf.edu](mailto:hsr@itsa.ucsf.edu).

**Editorial Board**

**Lu Ann Aday, Ph.D.**

University of Texas at Houston

**Laurence Baker, Ph.D.**

Stanford University

**David J. Ballard, M.D., Ph.D.**

Emory University

**Gloria J. Bazzoli, Ph.D.**

Virginia Commonwealth University

**Andrew Bindman, M.D.**

University of California at San Francisco

**Peter P. Budetti, M.D., J.D.**

University of Oklahoma

**Lawton R. Burns, Ph.D., M.B.A.**

The Wharton School, University  
of Pennsylvania

**Michael Chernew, Ph.D.**

University of Michigan

**Paul Cleary, Ph.D.**

Harvard University

**Jan P. Clement, Ph.D.**

Virginia Commonwealth University

**Douglas Conrad, Ph.D.**

University of Washington

**Gordon H. DeFrieze, Ph.D.**

University of North Carolina at  
Chapel Hill

**Barbara Dickey, Ph.D.**

Harvard University

**David Dranove, Ph.D.**

Northwestern University

**Arnold M. Epstein, M.D., M.A.**

Harvard University

**John R. Feussner, M.D.**

Medical University of South Carolina

**Dennis G. Fryback, Ph.D.**

University of Wisconsin

**Alan Garber, M.D., Ph.D.**

Stanford University  
Department of Veterans Affairs

**Martin Gaynor, Ph.D.**

Carnegie-Mellon University

**Lillian Gelberg, M.D.**

University of California at  
Los Angeles

**Sherry Glied, Ph.D.**

Columbia University

**Marsha R. Gold, Sc.D.**

Mathematica Policy Research, Inc.

**Kevin Grumbach, M.D.**

University of California at  
San Francisco

**Neal Halfon, M.D., M.P.H.**

University of California at  
Los Angeles

**L. Gary Hart, Ph.D.**

University of Washington

**Susan C. Hedrick, Ph.D.**

University of Washington and  
Department of Veterans Affairs

**Alan L. Hillman, M.D., M.B.A.**

University of Pennsylvania

**John Holahan, Ph.D.**

Urban Institute

**Robert M. Kaplan, Ph.D.**

University of California at  
San Diego

**Ronald C. Kessler, Ph.D.**

Harvard University

**Eric Larson, M.D.**

University of Washington

**Willard G. Manning Jr., Ph.D.**

University of Chicago

**Elizabeth McGlynn, Ph.D.**

RAND Health

**Marilyn Moon, Ph.D.**

American Institutes for Research

**Vincent Mor, Ph.D.**

Brown University

## Health Services Research

---

**Paul Newacheck, Dr.P.H.**

University of California  
at San Francisco

**Donna Rabiner, Ph.D.**

Research Triangle Institute

**Patrick Romano, M.D.**

University of California at Davis

**Sara Rosenbaum, J.D.**

George Washington University

**Thomas G. Rundall, Ph.D.**

University of California at Berkeley

**Greg Samsa, Ph.D.**

Duke University

**Richard M. Scheffler, Ph.D.**

University of California at Berkeley

**Mark Schlesinger, Ph.D.**

Yale University

**Kevin A. Schulman, M.D.**

Duke University Medical Center

**Martin F. Shapiro, M.D., Ph.D.**

University of California at Los Angeles

**Jane E. Sisk, Ph.D.**

Mt. Sinai School of Medicine

**Barbara Starfield, M.D.**

Johns Hopkins University

**Earl P. Steinberg, M.D., M.P.P.**

Resolution Health Inc.

**Edward Wagner, M.D.**

Group Health Cooperative of  
Puget Sound

**Kenneth Warner, Ph.D.**

University of Michigan

**Kenneth B. Wells, M.D.**

University of California at Los Angeles  
and RAND Health

### AcademyHealth Liaison Committee

**Robert J. Blendon, Sc.D.**

Harvard University

**Jack Hadley, Ph.D.**

Georgetown University

**Edward B. Perrin, Ph.D.**

University of Washington

---

---

 Guest Editors' Introduction
 

---

- |   |   |      |
|---|---|------|
| <i>Anne K. Gauthier and<br/>Carolyn M. Clancy</i> | Consumer-Driven Health Care—Beyond<br>Rhetoric with Research and Experience | 1049 |
|---|---|------|
- 

 Consumer-Driven Plans: What's Offered? Who Chooses?
 

---

- |   |  |      |
|---|--|------|
| <i>Meredith Rosenthal<br/>and Arnold Milstein</i> | Awakening Consumer Stewardship<br>of Health Benefits: Prevalence and<br>Differentiation of New Health<br>Plan Models | 1055 |
|---|--|------|
- 

- |   |   |      |
|---|---|------|
| <i>Anthony T. Lo Sasso,<br/>Thomas Rice,<br/>Jon R. Gabel,<br/>and Heidi Whitmore</i> | Tales from the New Frontier: Pioneers'<br>Experiences with Consumer-Driven<br>Health Care | 1071 |
|---|---|------|
- 

- |   |  |      |
|---|--|------|
| <i>Stephen T. Parente,<br/>Roger Feldman,<br/>and Jon B. Christianson</i> | Employee Choice of Consumer-Driven<br>Health Insurance in a Multiplan,<br>Multiproduct Setting | 1091 |
|---|--|------|
- 

- |                      |   |      |
|----------------------|---|------|
| <i>Greg Scandlen</i> | Commentary—How Consumer-Driven<br>Health Care Evolves in a Dynamic Market | 1113 |
|----------------------|---|------|
- 

- |                            |   |      |
|----------------------------|---|------|
| <i>George C. Halvorson</i> | Commentary—Current MSA Theory:<br>Well-Meaning but Futile | 1119 |
|----------------------------|---|------|
- 

 Evidence about Consumer Experiences
 

---

- |   |  |      |
|---|--|------|
| <i>Jon B. Christianson,<br/>Stephen T. Parente,<br/>and Roger Feldman</i> | Consumer Experiences in a<br>Consumer-Driven Health Plan | 1123 |
|---|--|------|
- 

- |   |  |      |
|---|--|------|
| <i>Jinnet Briggs Fowles,<br/>Elizabeth A. Kind,<br/>Barbara L. Braun,<br/>and John Bertko</i> | Early Experience with Employee Choice<br>of Consumer-Directed Health Plans<br>and Satisfaction with Enrollment | 1141 |
|---|--|------|
- 

- |                     |   |      |
|---------------------|---|------|
| <i>Gail Shearer</i> | Commentary—Defined Contribution<br>Health Plans: Attracting the Healthy<br>and Well-Off | 1159 |
|---------------------|---|------|
-



---

**Evidence about Utilization and Expenditures**

---

<i>Laura A. Tollen, Murray N. Ross, and Stephen Poor</i>	Risk Segmentation Related to the Offering of a Consumer-Directed Health Plan: A Case Study of Humana Inc.	1167
<i>Stephen T. Parente, Roger Feldman, and Jon B. Christianson</i>	Evaluation of the Effect of a Consumer- Driven Health Plan on Medical Care Expenditures and Utilization	1189
<i>John Bertko</i>	Commentary—Looking at the Effects of Consumer-Centric Health Plans on Expenditures and Utilization	1211

---

**Concluding Commentary**

---

<i>Karen Davis</i>	Consumer-Directed Health Care: Will It Improve Health System Performance?	1219
--------------------	---	------

---